



Transgender, Non-Binary and Two-Spirit Youth & Physical and Health Education

Environmental Scan

A. Travers, Department of Sociology & Anthropology, atravers@sfu.ca

K.J. Reed, Department of Gender, Sexuality, & Women's Studies, kjreed@sfu.ca

Simon Fraser University

February 2021

Table of Contents

1 Summary / 3

2 Search Strategy / 9

3 Scholarly Literature / 10

Transgender, non-binary and two-spirit student participation in Physical Health and Education (PHE), school sports, and intramurals / 10

Broad school experience with a substantial section on PHE, sport, and/or intramurals / 17

Trans, non-binary and two-spirit people in sports, with a section related to K-12 educational environments / 18

Pre-service teacher training related to trans youth in PHE and sport / 20

General school experiences of trans youth with passing mention of PHE and sport / 21

Other articles of note / 22

Trade publications / 24

Media / 25

4 Reports / 26

LGBTQ2S+ students & school PHE and sport, with a significant emphasis on transgender, non-binary and two-spirit students (Canada) / 26

School-wide support for trans students (includes mention of PHE) / 26

LGBTQ2S+ athletes in sport (Canada) / 27

Governmental guidance – Provincial / 29

Governmental guidance – Federal / 29

Transgender athletes in sport (international) / 30

SUMMARY

Transgender, non-binary, and two-spirit students experience significant obstacles to participation in Physical & Health Education (PHE) and school sport that are primarily related to sex-segregated and/or sex-differentiated programs, spaces and activities, and the sexist, homophobic and transphobic cultures these taken-for-granted organizational principles promote and/or reinforce.

By transgender or trans, this report refers to students who do not identify with the

binary sex category assigned to them at birth, whether they identify as boys or girls or another gender. Non-binary is a descriptor for students who identify outside the sex/gender binary and includes young people who may nor may not also identify as trans. Two-spirit is a specific term used in some Indigenous cultures to situate gender nonconforming Indigenous people within various specific Indigenous non-binary sex/gender/sexuality cultural systems.

Barriers to participation in PHE and school sport

Research on the experiences of trans/non-binary/two-spirit students in PE and school sport identifies a number of barriers to full participation, focusing chiefly on the sex-segregated/sex-differentiated character of sport, with specific attention to difficulties in accessing and using appropriate changing rooms. Additional barriers include sex-typed uniforms; bullying by peers and/or teachers; experiences of discrimination and alienation; the ignorance of teachers about the existence and needs of trans/non-binary/two-spirit students; as well

as gender dysphoria and self-exclusion. The difficulty experienced by non-binary students or trans boys and girls who do not 'pass,' meaning, who are not gender conforming, is cited as a significant limitation to policies that seek to integrate trans students into existing sex-based frameworks. Research to date also clearly indicates that students assigned male at birth who identify as girls or who fail to conform to masculine gender norms are especially vulnerable to censure and bullying.

Research and policy landscapes

Literature on the experiences of trans students in schools tends to be divided between that focusing on trans students as always accessing medical interventions to change genders (typically related to the U.S.), and other research that invokes a less binary and not necessarily medicalized notion of trans identities.

In terms of policies in place, there is a significant difference between the U.S. and Canada. The former is much more restrictive, with some states requiring extensive hoop-jumping and review for high school athletes to participate in sport consistent with their gender identity¹. Canadian policies at the high school level, in contrast, seem to universally enable trans students to choose between either sex category for participation.

A number of provinces and school districts across Canada have implemented trans-inclusive policies that either contain specific provisions for PHE and school sports or stipulate general principles for trans inclusion that can be applied to these contexts. Many of these policies, however, contain significant flaws: they are either predicated on waiting for a visible transgender student to show up for policy to be implemented or they are designed for the inclusion of trans students who identify as boys or

girls within existing sex-based spaces, programs and activities. Separately, or taken together, these flaws perpetuate the ongoing crisis that PHE and school sport represent for transgender, non-binary and/or two-spirit students who are flying under the radar.

As educational scholar, Mark Hellen, observes, the majority of transgender children are ‘non-apparent,’ or invisible (2009). These kids read the room, so to speak, and understand that their environments will not tolerate them, so they remain hidden to avoid censure and hostility. The negative mental health impacts of intolerant environments on trans/non-binary/two-spirit youth has been extensively documented and occurs whether these young people share their gender identities with others or not.

Sex segregated and sex differentiated spaces and activities put all trans students, both visible and invisible, in crisis. Appropriate policies for transgender inclusion, therefore, focus on transforming PHE and sport environments, programs and activities away from sex-based categories rather than focusing solely on supporting the inclusion of individual trans/non-binary/two-spirit students who makes themselves known to school personnel.

¹ It will be interesting to track the impact of new directives from the Biden administration on the right of transgender students to access facilities and programs on the basis of affirmed gender identity (an Obama directive to this effect was repealed by the Trump administration and Biden just signed a sweeping pro-LGBT executive order).

Travers (2006, 2021, forthcoming) makes a distinction between “gender conforming” and “gender transforming” transgender-inclusion policies. Gender conforming transgender participation policies seek to accommodate trans people within existing sporting institutions and cultures while gender transforming policies require sporting institutions and cultures to change. The former, unsurprisingly, is much easier to achieve than the latter because it does not trouble or disrupt physical/organizational infrastructure and taken-for-granted assumptions and beliefs. The status quo of sex-based spaces, programs and activities, however, reinforce sexist and anti-LGBT norms that operate to stigmatize and exclude.

Implementing appropriate trans-inclusive policies is an important first step in meeting the needs of trans, non-binary and two-spirit students. Such policy can be leveraged by students themselves, or more commonly, by parents of trans students, to force school personnel and district officials to accommodate them. Trans students who are able to leverage these policies, however, tend to be socio-economically privileged and fully supported by parents who have the knowledge, experience and time to navigate institutional environments, circumstances and capacities that are unequally distributed.



Recommendations for “gender transformative” **transgender-inclusive PHE**

1 Don't wait for a visible trans student to show up

Educational administrators and school personnel should begin the work of making PHE and school sport more inclusive for trans/non-binary/two-spirit students on the basis of the knowledge that these students are always, already in attendance. Waiting for a visible trans student to show up and request accommodation fails to meet the needs of the most vulnerable trans, non-binary, two-spirit students.

2 Transform PHE away from binary sex to All-gender

This necessarily entails a significant amount of cultural work by school districts and within school communities to accompany changes to policies, programs, spaces and activities.

3 Universal design of facilities

Replace sex-segregated facilities with all-gender facilities providing private change room/shower facilities for all students, rather than singling out/isolating trans/non-binary/two-spirit students. Precedent: community centre/pool all-gender/family changerooms in Vancouver and elsewhere.

4 Allow students to participate in street clothes

The little research that does involve trans kids themselves indicates that gendered physical education uniforms are a barrier to participation and that students prefer to wear street clothes.

Gaps in Research

Overall, there is very little research about the experiences of transgender students in PHE and school sports and nothing specifically about two-spirit youth, or about non-binary students who do not identify as trans.

- **Disjuncture between policy and experience**

While appropriate trans-inclusion policies are important, without the accompaniment of significant cultural work on the part of school districts and school communities, they fail to achieve even the bare minimum standard for trans-inclusive practice in that they do not significantly reduce barriers to the participation of trans/non-binary/two-spirit students.

Very limited research has been undertaken to explore the experiences of trans/non-binary/two-spirit students in school districts where trans-inclusive policies have been implemented. The exception to this is a University of Manitoba Master's thesis, by J. R. Hutton (2017). This MA thesis analyzes the 2015 *Manitoba High Schools Athletic Association Policy on Transgender Students* that states "any transgender student athlete may participate fully and safely in sex-separated sports activities in accordance with his or her gender identity" (p. 4). On the basis of interviews with four transgender high school students and five policy stake-holders, Hutton found that, despite the policy being in place, none of the trans youth participants knew of its existence prior to the research. Hutton concludes that having a trans-inclusive policy on its own is insufficient to improve the experiences of trans students with PHE and high school sport. If the policy is implemented without being promoted and enforced, it has little impact on the experience of trans students. This research makes it clear that deliberate culture-building must follow policy change and that the voices of trans students must be included every step of the way.

- **Lack of intersectional analysis in the majority of research**

The impact of gender on life experience always intersects with other social categories of identity – most notably, race, class, sexuality, citizenship, and ability. Most research on transgender children and young people disproportionately accounts for the experiences of relatively privileged trans kids (white, middle- and upper-class, binary-conforming, with supportive parents). Only Sykes (2011), Hutton (2017) and Travers (2018) take intersecting identities up in any substantial way.

Gaps in Research

- **Very few examples of specific programs and/or the role and experience of school personnel in championing trans-inclusion**

Literature relating to examples of specific programs is sparse in the published and grey literature. Other programs may exist, but reports are not being published via academic channels or made available online. This may be because educators are doing this work off the sides of their desks. A related gap in research relates to the roles of school personnel in actualizing – or resisting - these policies. It is reasonable to speculate that policies only become meaningful as a result of individual district and school personnel who make a personal and professional investment in issues related to gender and sexual diversity inclusion.

Directions for Future Research

Gaps in research suggest the need for intersectional and gender-inclusive (trans, non-binary, two-spirit, and beyond) research on the relationship between policy and practice that is school- and/or district-based. There is also a need for more research relating to gender transformative interventions: examples, obstacles, and lessons learned.

SEARCH STRATEGY

The resources in this report were found via two main sources of information. First, general discovery-layer searches using Primo were conducted within the SFU library. PHE Canada's requested search phrases were translated into language best suited for this type of search:

- transgender school sports
- transgender sports ("high school" OR "secondary school")
- (nonbinary OR non-binary) sports ("high school" OR "secondary school")
- (transgender OR nonbinary OR non-binary) "physical activity"
- (transgender OR nonbinary OR non-binary) intramurals

Similar searches were conducted within the ERIC and SPORTDiscus databases, utilizing subject headings as appropriate in the search string (ex. transgender OR transsexual OR transsexual OR gender variant OR gender non-conforming OR nonbinary AND school sports [SU] OR physical education [SU]).

Aside from SFU Library, academic literature was also sought via Google Scholar. Similar search terms to the ones outlined above were used. A second strategy of spot-checking important articles was also utilized; the titles of ten of the most commonly-found, on-topic articles and books were entered directly into Google Scholar in order to use the citation feature. This option enables one to view literature that has cited the original work since it was first published, and is a strategy to find the most recent publications that may not be highlighted in library searches.

To find reports and programs outside of the academic literature, multiple Google searches were undertaken on google.ca, including adding in filetype:pdf, which generally finds PDF reports from interest groups, governments, and non-governmental organizations (i.e., grey literature). In order to search for reports and programs in other countries, the researcher routed their internet connection via virtual private connections in New Zealand, the Netherlands, South Africa, and Britain. The effect is that more regional content is displayed than would otherwise be found via Canadian Google.

Finally, searches restricted to the websites of international organizations (ex. International Gay, Lesbian, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer & Youth and Student Organization, European Union) were undertaken. This was one last method of spot-checking; these organizations were found in searches for content related to transgender youth, but without references to PHE or sport. The researcher wanted to ensure that they did not miss any documents these organizations might have published that might be relevant to this review.



Scholarly Literature

LITERATURE - Trans non-binary, and two-spirit student participation in Physical and Health Education (PHE), school sports, and intramurals

Buzuvis, E. E. (2016). As Who They Really Are: Expanding Opportunities for Transgender Athletes to Participate in Youth and Scholastic Sports. *Law & Inequality: A Journal of Theory and Practice*, 34(2), 341–384.

Written with US scholastic athletics and youth sports decision-makers as the audience, this article explores how to (and why) create trans-inclusive policies. Buzuvis begins with an overview of existing birth certificate, hormone, and gender-consonant special-permission policies among US State Interscholastic Athletic Associations, followed by consideration of the same policies among US national non-scholastic youth sports organizations. Both restrictive and model policies are highlighted and situated in relation to *Title IX* and the Constitution. The author recommends minimizing procedural obstacles to participation (ex., multiple levels of gender review prior to competition) and implementing policies that enhance inclusion (ex. using the athlete's correct name and pronouns, and allowing the athlete to dress in the appropriate uniform).

Buzuvis's recommended policy requires a student whose gender does not match the school record to register their intent to play on a team that is consistent with

their gender with both the school and the state athletic commission. The state athletic commission's Gender Identity Eligibility Committee must approve the student's plan and any member of the state athletic commission who feels this Committee made the wrong decision has the right to appeal it. This so-called model policy is onerous for trans students, however, as it requires them to go through multiple levels of authority and experience potential political conflict. This stands in stark contrast to all of the best practices outlined below in Canadian reports.

Practices: Name, pronouns, change rooms, hotel rooms appropriate to an athlete's specified gender identity. Need for school officials to notify officials when playing at other schools about their expectation that the trans athlete will have access to appropriate facilities and that the correct name and pronouns will be used by officials, coaches, fans, media, etc.

Carroll, H. J. (2017). Including transgender students in United States' school-based athletics. In E. Anderson & A. Travers (Eds.), *Transgender Athletes in Competitive Sport* (2nd ed., pp. 143–155). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315304274>

The author opens this book chapter highlighting the lack of consideration and preparedness for including transgender student athletes. They recommend that coaches and PHE teachers have a basic awareness of issues relating to transgender students so that inclusive policies can be put into place. Carroll then provides an introduction to what transgender identity is and why it should be addressed in school sports programs. A section addressing concerns about competitive equity unpacks and debunks three underlying assumptions of anti-trans resistance: that trans girls are not 'real' women, that being born with a male body automatically gives trans girls a competitive advantage against cisgender girls, and that boys might pretend to be transgender in order to participate in sports with girls (p. 148). Carroll then turns to the benefits of adopting inclusive strategies and the consequences of failing to do so. The chapter ends with recommended policy. At the high school level, this policy is full participation according to self-determined gender identity, regardless of birth certificate or medical treatment (p. 153).

Note that an earlier version of this chapter was published as: Carroll, H. J. (2014). Joining the team: The inclusion of transgender students in United States school-based athletics. In J. Hargreaves & E. Anderson (Eds.), Routledge

Handbook of Sport, Gender and Sexuality (pp. 387–395). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203121375-51>

Caudwell, J. (2014). [Transgender] young men: Gendered subjectivities and the physically active body. *Sport, Education and Society*, 19(4), 398–414. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13573322.2012.672320>

Focusing on the lives of two young men (who identify as ‘men’ rather than ‘trans men’), the author considers how they experience sport from a social, physical, and embodied perspective. The complex negotiation of “outness” that is required by the study participants is a theme, as one man fit himself into a sex-segregated school sporting environment. He describes being chased out of a locker room (p. 404) and being forced to wear the girls’ uniform. The other participant, in contrast, attended an all-girls school. This caused him to experience less hostility, as did the fact that at the time he was more gender fluid. Both men were reluctant to understand sports as central to their masculinity and refuted stereotypical notions of masculinity. Their objection to the type of transphobic masculinity and the danger it posed to them kept them away from organized men’s sports.

In addition to documenting the sporting lives of two participants, Caudwell carefully considers the complexities of lumping together transgender into an LGBT framework, as well as the idea that any of the LGBT categories are discrete and stable. In particular, Caudwell highlights Travers’ (2006) work complicating the idea of transgender individuals conforming to simplistic gender binaries.

Caudwell questions the value to trans students of current “dominant neo-liberal PE curricula and accompanying body ethics: curricula and ethics that purportedly promote ‘fun,’ ‘joy’ and good ‘health’ for all participants,” in light of the harm this particular group experiences (p. 406). In line with Travers (2006) and Sykes (2011), Caudwell advocates for reorganizing PHE away from boys/girls’ divisions.

Practices: Cease dividing PHE by boys/girls, consider transgender students’ needs apart from LGB students.

Devís-Devís, J., Pereira-García, S., López-Cañada, E., Pérez-Samaniego, V., & Fuentes-Miguel, J. (2018). Looking back into trans persons’ experiences in heteronormative secondary physical education contexts. *Physical Education and Sport Pedagogy*, 23(1), 103–116. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17408989.2017.1341477>

While this paper focuses on transgender experiences of high school physical education, it is written from the perspective of adults (n=9) reflecting on their pasts. Ranging in age from 23-62, participants reported experiencing loneliness, isolation, and harassment as a price for not fitting into the binary gender system that was prevalent in physical education courses and school in general. The authors identify four main themes. First, the organization of PE courses prevented participants from playing with their desired gender group. Second, they experienced gender and sexuality expectations in different ways. For example, most of the trans men in the study reported PE as their favourite subject because it allowed them to express masculinity and partake in activities in which they were skilled. The trans women in the study found PE to be a particularly negative and demotivating experience. Third, bullying and harassment in PE classes was frequent and largely based on gender transgressions. Fourth, uneasiness with body intimacy – both self and others’ – made change rooms particularly problematic spaces. Participants reported that PE teachers upheld heteronormativity and did little to support trans students.

One important note is that all participants understood their trans identities in binary terms (i.e., they all understood themselves to be either men or women, as opposed to non-binary). This binary logic influenced how they experience PE. For example, one trans woman reported loving ballet because it symbolized femininity to her. Additionally, at the time of their schooling, no participants had begun physically transitioning. The authors point out that youth who have physically transitioned may have a different experience of PE. They conclude the article questioning whether PE going forward should work to include trans students in the existing programs, or instead “work towards queering and deconstructing curricular and educational contexts” (p. 114).

Practices: Reorganizing PE so that classes are not divided along gender lines. Reconceptualizing PE to be based on non-binary principles.

Ferrey, A. (2020). Environmental impact on physical activity and health in transgender youth. *Revista Brasileira de Educação Física e Esporte*, 34(Esp.), 87–95.
<https://doi.org/10.11606/issn.1981-4690.v34i0p87-95>

Similar to Devís-Devís et al. (2018), this research is with adult transgender participants who reflect back on the barriers to physical activity they faced as

youth. The sample (n = 50) was one of convenience, with recruitment that included friends and colleagues. Unsurprisingly, the sample is fairly homogenous: largely white and trans female. Ferrey found a correlation between PE teachers not confronting transphobic behaviour and a lack of a safe space for trans youth. There was also a correlation between the highlighting of trans role models by PE teachers and the teachers confronting transphobic behaviour. Participants reported that all-gender PHE would have been a more motivating environment.

Practices: PHE not divided by gender.

Foley, J. T., Pineiro, C., Miller, D., & Foley, M. L. (2016). Including transgender students in school physical education. *Journal of Physical Education, Recreation & Dance*, 87(3), 5–8. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07303084.2016.1131544>

This resource is the only one in this report that is specific to working with elementary school-aged trans kids. It includes primer material (i.e., stats, definitions, context) and then focusses on the opinions of an elementary school teacher who has taught trans youth, and a pre-service teacher who began identifying as trans in elementary school. The current teacher identifies the strength of working in a unified, team-based approach within the school, in which all of the various teachers and officials who are a part of the student's life work together with the student and their parents to create a supportive environment and solve issues. He also indicates the importance of not grouping students by sex, the need for access to a universal bathroom, and the obligation teachers have to teach and show respect to all children. Reflecting on their experience of being trans in elementary school, the pre-service teacher recommends using students' self-determined names and pronouns, allowing students to change in bathrooms instead of change rooms for privacy, letting students use unisex washrooms, and taking appropriate action with regard to bullying. They also give advice on what to do if a teacher accidentally makes a mistake and uses the wrong pronoun.

This article is directed at elementary school teachers, some of whom presumably may react with fear upon learning they are working with a trans child (p. 6). The authors identify a need to speak directly to teachers like these, some of whom believe that gender identity issues occur only at later stages of schooling (p. 5).

Practices: Team-based schools (i.e., all teachers and officials work with parent and student) that allow for a unified school response. Allowing students to use bathrooms to change instead of locker rooms, so that they have privacy.

Hutton, J. R. (2017). Exploring the Effectiveness and Impact of the MHSAA Policy on Transgender Students: Learning from the Experiences of Trans-Youth in Manitoba High Schools. MA Thesis. University of Manitoba.
https://mspace.lib.umanitoba.ca/bitstream/handle/1993/32490/hutton_j_rae.pdf

The Manitoba High Schools Athletic Association's 2015 policy states that "any transgender student athlete may participate fully and safely in sex-separated sports activities in accordance with his or her gender identity" (p. 4). This MA thesis analyzes the policy on the basis of interviews with trans youth in high school (n = 4) and policy stakeholders (n = 5). Despite the policy being in place, Hutton learned that none of the trans youth participants knew of its existence prior to the research. As a result, Hutton concludes that "the existence of a policy does not necessarily make it easier, more encouraging, or accepting for trans- high school students to participate in sport and sports culture" (p. 4). There are issues with the policy that include it not being promoted or enforced, students having to identify if their teachers are supportive or not before broaching the subject of the policy, students needing to "out" themselves to play on sex-segregated teams and the policy's exclusive reliance on binary pronouns (i.e., "his or her") that are not welcoming to some two-spirit and non-binary students. This research makes it clear that deliberate culture-building must accompany policy changes, and that the voices of trans students must be included every step of the way.

Of all the academic literature in this environmental scan, this thesis contains the most nuanced description of the experiences of trans youth in high school PHE courses and sports. Participants confirmed that sex-segregated PE courses were uncomfortable spaces. One trans youth reported loving PE after moving to an alternative school that had mixed-gender classes and no requirement for students to change into athletic clothing to participate (p. 153). The trans youth interviewed for this thesis recommended basing sports on skill-level rather than gender (p. 183).

Participants gave feedback on unisex washrooms; while in theory they allow for privacy and comfort, in reality, being separated from their peers in gender-segregated change rooms made them feel like outsiders. Furthermore, the participants described the range of transphobia that they experience in school, noting that covert transphobia, which one participant linked to the assumed "politeness" that Canadians often hide behind (p. 163), is just as damaging as overt transphobia. Another participant who identifies as Indigenous, linked racism and transphobia together in describing their experiences, identifying PE class as

particularly unwelcoming to them (p. 166). Finally, trans students reported feeling discouraged by the general sports-loving climates of schools, to the detriment of social justice clubs and other equitable opportunities (p. 168).

Practices: Ensure Black, Indigenous, and students of colour are represented in any analysis of trans youth in PHE. Skill-based PHE and sports teams instead of gender-based. Allowing students to participate in street clothing instead of forcing them to change into athletic gear. Strengthen school cultures to value other forms of recreation and involvement beyond sports.

Sykes, H. (2011). *Queer bodies: Sexualities, genders, and fatness in physical education*. Peter Lang.

This book considers how Canadian students who are LGBTQ+ and/or overweight deal with homophobia, transphobia, and fat phobia in PE. Chapter three outlines the experiences of trans, intersex, and gender non-conforming students. Sykes concludes: “The analysis suggests that a transphobic imagination in physical education permeates taken-for-granted, professional ideas about gender; moreover, this transphobia imagination is so thoroughly normalized that it seems unremarkable” (p. 35). This statement is based on experiences described by students. Similar to other authors on this list, Sykes found that students frequently mentioned change rooms (p. 45) and gender-binary-based organization of students (p. 44) as being central issues in PE participation.

Importantly, this chapter considers the experience of how physical disability, sexuality, and gender identity (and to a lesser extent, class and racialization) are interwoven to mark certain bodies as normal and others as out of place within PHE courses and sporting culture (p. 37-38). Sykes concludes that schools must go beyond simply accommodating trans and/or disabled students, instead centering them and building a new approach based on universal design principles (p. 47).

LITERATURE - Broad school experience with a substantial section on PHE, sport, and/or intramurals

Howell, T. & Allen, L. (2020): 'Good morning boys': Fa'afāfine and Fakaleiti experiences of cisgenderism at an all-boys secondary school. *Sex Education*.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/14681811.2020.1813701>

Howell and Allen explore the experiences of fa'afāfine and fakaleiti youth at an all-boys school in Aotearoa-New Zealand. As the authors explain, "Fa'afāfine are Samoan, and fakaleiti Tongans who are assigned male at birth, but enact varying degrees and types of behaviour deemed as feminine" (p. 1). The research found that teachers and other students bullied, physically assaulted and marginalized fa'afāfine and fakaleiti students. Their identities were pathologized and erased in curricula. Physical education was identified as a space of particular difficulty that led to participants avoiding or dropping these courses; change rooms and the organization of teams into "shirts and skins" were specifically mentioned as barriers to participation. Even when a private change cubicle was available, one participant reported feel singled out as different and experienced herself as an object of curiosity among cisgender students (p. 7). In addition to Physical Education, after-school sports posed a problem, as the soccer team required a masculine performance that included players "wearing a sports uniform, having a hairstyle and acting in a manner that was congruent with expectations of how boys should outwardly present" (p. 7). Despite wanting to participate, fa'afāfine and fakaleiti students did not join the team because they were unwilling to sacrifice their femininity. The authors conclude that school is marked as a cisgender space that recognizes only two assigned-at-birth binary genders (i.e., female and male).

Practices: No "shirts and skins" teams, need for universal design (private change cubicle made participants feel like a curiosity)

(2018). What are your approaches, experiences, observations, and/or policies pertaining to the inclusion of transgender people in physical education classes and/or sport teams? *Journal of Physical Education, Recreation & Dance*, 89(1), 59–60. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07303084.2018.1393236>

This short Q & A section includes five current and future teachers and coaches – all of whom are supportive - responding to questions related to trans inclusion in PHE and sports.

LITERATURE - Trans, non-binary and two-spirit people in sports, with a section related to K-12 educational environments

Hargie, O. D., Mitchell, D. H., & Somerville, I. J. (2017). 'People have a knack of making you feel excluded if they catch on to your difference': Transgender experiences of exclusion in sport. *International Review for the Sociology of Sport*, 52(2), 223–239. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1012690215583283>

This small (n=10) qualitative study explored the experiences of adult transgender people in sport, situated within Meyer's minority stress (2003) framework. Four themes among the Belfast-based participants emerged, highlighting their relational, spatial, and functional exclusion from sport and recreation opportunities. First, changing/locker room environments posed the biggest barrier to participation. Participants highlighted anxiety produced by a lack of knowledge of how to act in highly gendered spaces, worries about how their presence in the space might adversely affect other people, and discomfort with having to use the incorrect sex-segregated space. Second, simply appearing in public (ex. at a swimming pool) might "out" participants and/or invite transphobia. Participants reported having to give careful thought to safe routes and possible dangers. They described being particularly sensitive to rejection on the basis of their gender. Third, participants reported poor mental and physical health due to the exclusionary nature of sports and recreation opportunities. This particularly troubled them in the context of the need to be in good physical health for transition surgeries. They also flagged the high cost of many recreation opportunities, noting that transgender people tend to have lower paying jobs (p. 233).

The last and most relevant theme identified in this article addresses the negative experiences reported with regard to school sports, which led to feelings of rejection, inadequacy and guilt that carried on into adulthood. One sub-theme concerned the expectation of masculinity among members of male school sports teams that made the environment uncomfortable, especially for trans women.

Trans women reported avoiding this discomfort by instead turning to individual sports that did not carry the same gendered expectations. A second sub-theme concerned the role of teachers in shaping and upholding exclusionary sports environments.

Practices: Participants wanted universal small cubicles in change rooms for everyone. Changing the belief that one needs to be masculine in order to play sports.

Travers, A. (2019). Transgender and gender-nonconforming kids and the binary requirements of sport participation in North America. In M.A. Messner & M. Musto (Eds.), *Child's Play: Sport in Kids' World* (pp. 179–201). Rutgers University Press. <https://doi.org/10.36019/9780813571478-010>

This book chapter is a wide-ranging overview of the challenge to binary sex-based categories in sports that transgender athletes have posed historically and recently. While the first half is focused on elite-level adult athletes, the remainder of the chapter considers children and youth. Travers makes this pivot by comparing the various levels of policy from the International Olympic Committee (IOC) to National Collegiate Athletic Association (NCAA) and Canadian University Athletic Association (CUAA) and high school. They highlight multiple reports urging policy-makers to ensure that kids participate on the basis of their self-identified gender. However, this recommended policy has not been rolled out evenly throughout Canada and the U.S. and trans youth still face barriers to participation that include sex-segregated environments (i.e., locker rooms, washrooms), binary-based uniforms, and sports instruction that is based in cultural beliefs about masculinity and femininity (p. 659).

This contribution to the literature is unique compared to other entries in this report in a number of ways. First, while other articles in this report mention participants reporting sporting environments as stereotypically masculine, Travers takes this further, and situates sports within wider systems of power. For example, they demonstrate how “mainstream competitive and amateur sport still plays a central role in naturalizing an ideology of a two-sex system (Fausto-Sterling, 2000) while normalizing white cisgender, heterosexual masculinity and class privilege (Hill Collins, 2005)” (p. 651). Second, Travers makes a distinction between formal and informal rules, with the former based in policy and the latter based in socio-cultural norms (p. 658). Third, drawing on Hellen’s (2009) work, they emphasize that the majority of trans kids are non-apparent, with the implication being

that trans kids do not need to be visible to be harmed by sex-based spaces and programming (p. 659). Finally, they advance a nuanced analysis of measures for increasing transgender inclusion while recognizing that sex segregated sport has some benefits in terms of providing opportunities for girls to improve skills and confidence (p. 660).

Practices: Need to include an intersectional analysis (i.e., consider the experiences of youth not just related to gender, but also race, ethnicity, class, ability, etc.) when considering trans youth participation in sports. Differentiating youth sports from elite-level competition in terms of sex-differentiated uniforms and activities (e.g., no need to separate gymnastic activities based on different genders). Trans-inclusive optional segregated spaces for girls as an interim measure.

LITERATURE - Pre-service teacher training related to trans youth in PHE and sport

Devís-Devís, J., Pereira-García, S., Fuentes-Miguel, J., López-Cañada, E., & Pérez-Samaniego, V. (2018). Opening up to trans persons in Physical Education–Sport Tertiary Education: Two case studies of recognition in queer pedagogy. *Physical Education and Sport Pedagogy*, 23(6), 623–635. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17408989.2018.1485142>

This article reports on two interventions that were undertaken with different groups of Spanish education students, with the aim of challenging heteronormativity and increasing empathy: use of a fictional story and resulting discussion (n = 61), and the embodied experience of queer tango in which students (n = 111) were asked to switch gender roles. Both activities met with mixed success. Some students reinscribed sex/gender binaries, some refused appropriate naming, some goofed around, while others experienced an increase in their acceptance of and respect for trans people. The authors call for enhanced training related to gender identity for students.

Pérez-Samaniego, V., Fuentes-Miguel, J., Pereira-García, S., & Devís-Devís, J. (2016). Abjection and alterity in the imagining of transgender in physical education and sport: A pedagogical approach in higher education. *Sport, Education and Society*, 21(7), 985–1002. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13573322.2014.981253>

This article describes one of the interventions discussed in Devís-Devís et al. (2018), described above. Spanish education students (n = 61) participated in a reading and discussion of a fictional representation of a trans undergraduate student in their program. The authors unpack their responses to the pedagogical activity through a theoretical continuum between abjection and alterity. Students who expressed disgust were found to be in the former category, while the latter group included students who expressed compassion, tolerance, and/or acceptance.

LITERATURE - General school experiences of trans youth with passing mention of PHE and sport

While PE is highlighted as one of the most trying subjects for trans non-binary, and two-spirit students in other literature (i.e., Howell & Allen, 2020), the following articles on school experiences only have passing mention of PHE and school sports.

Bartholomaeus, C., & Riggs, D. W. (2017). Whole-of-school approaches to supporting transgender students, staff, and parents. *International Journal of Transgenderism*, 18(4), 361–366. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15532739.2017.1355648>

Advocates whole-of-school approach to creating inclusive schools for trans students. Briefly mentions that students should participate in school sports and PE according to their affirmed gender, and that broader inclusion policies should be in place in interschool sports.

McBride, R.-S. (2020). A literature review of the secondary school experiences of trans youth. *Journal of LGBT Youth*, 1–32. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19361653.2020.1727815>

Only has a single sentence on physical health and education and sports, citing three studies.

Davis, C. (2015). *School-based Supports for Trans Youth in Ontario*. Master's Thesis, Wilfrid Laurier University. <https://scholars.wlu.ca/etd/1782>

Passing mention of discriminatory school policies related to trans students not being able to play with their desired gender category and the reluctance of some

teachers to use correct pronouns and names.

McGuire, J. K., Anderson, C. R., Toomey, R. B., & Russell, S. T. (2010). School climate for transgender youth: A mixed method investigation of student experiences and school responses. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence*; New York, 39(10), 1175–1188. <http://dx.doi.org.proxy.lib.sfu.ca/10.1007/s10964-010-9540-7>

Brief mention of a desire among student study participants for queer sports in school (p. 1183).

Sausa, L. A. (2005). Translating research into practice: Trans youth recommendations for improving school systems. *Journal of Gay & Lesbian Issues in Education*, 3(1), 15–28. https://doi.org/10.1300/J367v03n01_04

Notes that many of the participants avoided PE classes and locker rooms (p. 21), and that policies should be in place to allow students to choose whether to join the boys' or girls' sports team (p. 26).

LITERATURE - Other articles of note

Bishop, A., Overcash, F., McGuire, J., & Reicks, M. (2020). Diet and physical activity behaviors among adolescent transgender students: School survey results. *Journal of Adolescent Health*, 66(4), 484–490. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jadohealth.2019.10.026>

This article addresses broad issues of health and fitness among transgender and gender nonconforming (TGNC) (n=2168) and cisgender (n=78761) students in grades 9 and 11 in Minnesota. One aspect of the inquiry compared physical activity levels among the two populations; researchers asked about participation in school sports and attendance in PHE classes as a part of this dataset. Table 3 breaks down the sport and PHE class questions and responses by participant subsection. The researchers found that TGNC students were less likely to be physically active compared to cisgender students. Within the TGNC sample group, those assigned male at birth reported less physical activity than those assigned females at birth and cisgender boys and girls.

Hacke, R. D. (2018). "Girls will be Boys, and Boys will be Girls": The Emergence of the Transgender Athlete and a Defensive Game Plan for High Schools that want to Keep their Playing Fields Level—For Athletes of Both Genders. *Texas Review of Entertainment and Sports Law*, 18(2), 131–153.

While this article is directly on the subject of transgender athletes in high school sport, it is written from the perspective of someone who wishes to prevent inclusive policies for transgender students. Hacke advocates for sports to be divided based on "biological gender" (p. 153). The article is included in this section because of the minor status of the journal in which it is published, and the dissonance with all other articles found.

Hayden, L. (2020). Nurturing healthy transitions: Nutrition, exercise, and body image for transgender and gender diverse youth. In Y. N. Evans & A. Dixon Docter (Eds.), *Adolescent Nutrition* (pp. 795–820). Springer International Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-45103-5_26

Based on her experience as a professional at a Gender Clinic at Seattle Children's Hospital, Hayden explores various elements of health and wellness for trans and gender diverse youth, including a substantial section on PE and organized sport. She highlights issues based largely on the sex binary organization of sport, including locker room access, teams based on "boy" and "girl" identities, uniforms, and bullying. As trans students turn away from organized sports, Hayden describes how the onus then falls to individuals and families to access exercise opportunities, which she links to class privilege (p. 801). Individual youth left to exercise without supervision may push themselves beyond safe limits and injure themselves and/or develop unhealthy exercise habits (p. 802).

Hennig, L. C., Schaefer, L., & Gleddie, D. (2020). In(di)visible: Inquiring into being 'othered' as a means to teach social justice in PHETE. *Physical Education and Sport Pedagogy*, 25(6), 666–680. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17408989.2020.1789573>

This article considers how to motivate pre-service PHE teachers to incorporate socially just and culturally-responsive practices into their thinking and pedagogy. It is a small study (n = 3) that is based on autobiographical narrative inquiry, in which the participants considered their own power and privilege. While sexism and heteronormativity are mentioned, there is no specific mention of cissexism or transgender issues. Still, I include it here as an example of teacher training that includes an examination of one's own privilege.

LITERATURE - Trade Publications

Kaiser, M. M., Seitz, K. M., & Walters, E. A. (2014). Transgender policy: What is fair for all students? *Journal of Cases in Educational Leadership*, 17(1), 3–16.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/1555458913518538>

This case study offers educators and pre-service teachers an opportunity to consider how to handle the fictitious case of a trans student who was assigned female at birth but is presenting increasingly as male, yet currently using the girls' changeroom. Citing "safety and security" (p. 3), a female student and her parents object to this student's continued use of the girls' changeroom. The authors offer some introductory thoughts and further resources on each topic and ask readers to consider the case in light of U.S. law, ethics and morals, school district policies and critical theory and queer theory.

Krane, V., & Barak, K. S. (2012). Current events and teachable moments: Creating dialog about transgender and intersex athletes. *Journal of Physical Education, Recreation & Dance*, 83(4), 38–43. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07303084.2012.10598761>

The goal of this article is to raise awareness and understanding of transgender and intersex athletes among PE teachers and coaches, so that they may in turn discuss the topics with students. The article provides an overview of basic definitions, tackles common misconceptions about trans athletes, and strategizes how to discuss the topic with students.

Mahoney, T. Q., Dodds, M. A., & Polasek, K. M. (2015). Progress for Transgender Athletes: Analysis of the School Success and Opportunity Act. *Journal of Physical Education, Recreation & Dance*, 86(6), 45–47.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/07303084.2015.1054202>

This short law review article introduces the California School Success and Opportunity Act, which is a one sentence statement affirming that students may participate in school activities (including sports) consistent with their gender identity, regardless of the sex on their birth certificate. The authors consider the implication for transgender students and how other sports associations such as the NCAA and the IOC approach trans athletes. They also address some of the controversy surrounding the inclusion of trans athletes, including notions of "unfair advantage" and the fear that the presence of trans athletes will "expose cis students to uncomfortable situations."

Stocz, M., Shremshock, P., & Benner, R. (2019). Transgender considerations in physical education. *Journal of Physical Education, Recreation & Dance*, 90(5), 45–46.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/07303084.2019.1583023>

This U.S. legal brief outlines the case of a trans woman who retroactively attempted to sue her former school district for alleged discrimination based on denial of full change room access versus having to change in a private stall within the change room. Although the case was declared moot, the authors caution that school administrators must be aware of transgender students' needs.

Media

Barnett, M. (2019). *Changing the Game*. <https://www.facebook.com/ChangingGameDoc>

This film follows three American transgender athletes as they compete at the high school level. The Mountain Film Festival describes the film: “For young transgender athletes, the sport they love often turns into a minefield of controversy. Either decried as cheaters if they excel, or barred from competing among the gender they identify with, positive outcomes are rare. But when a sport is a lifeline, what is fair? This exceptional film mines that question through intimate portraits of three trans athletes. Mack isn’t allowed to wrestle boys in his home state of Texas — leaving him to demolish the competition as he wrestles girls. Sarah Nordic skis in New Hampshire with the girls she identifies with, but admits that she holds herself back. And Andraya runs track with girls in Connecticut — but has to fend off brutal criticism when she prevails. For these athletes, media attention and ugly remarks (mostly by adults) only fuel the fire of confusion that is teenage hood. As Mack puts it so poignantly, “It feels like I’m winning but feels like I’m also losing at the same time.” (<https://www.mountainfilm.org/media/changing-the-game>)

REPORTS - LGBTQ2S+ students & school PHE and sport, with a significant emphasis on transgender and non-binary students (Canada)

Tran, S., Johnson, L., Lewis, A.-M., & Murphy, L. (2020). Using daily physical activity and health and wellness instruction in support of LGBTQ2+ students: An inquiry by coaches / classroom teachers at Aspen Park Elementary in Comox, BC. [unpublished report obtained from author].

A group of four elementary school teachers formed an inquiry group to consider the following question: “What would a SOGI-sensitive¹ Physical Education Curriculum look like, and what resources will we need to truly engage our LGBTQ2+ students with healthy lifestyle choices?” This report covers their attempts to create this environment within their school, reflecting on the results of the changes they have implemented around language, team organization, and shifting focus from team sports to individualized goals in a group environment. The authors then consider future directions for their work, including “‘Player-experience’ structured sports teams” (p. 5). This report contains significant insights on the subject of making gender-diverse students welcome in PHE environments.

REPORTS - School-wide support for trans students (includes mention of PHE)

Canadian Teachers’ Federation. (2019). Supporting transgender and transsexual students in K-12 schools: A guide for educators.

A broad guide that considers the whole school environment, this report does have a small section on athletics and change rooms. The authors advise that students be “permitted to participate in any gender-segregated activities in accordance with their consistently asserted gender identity, if they so choose” (p. 42). Universal design is included in the recommendations, with readers advised that any student who desires increased privacy should have access to private facilities.

¹ SOGI is the British Columbia provincial education acronym for “sexual orientation and gender identity,” and the name of recently-developed curriculum.

REPORTS: LGBTQ2S+ athletes in sport (Canada)

While the following Canadian resources are not about youth specifically, they are frequently cited as resources for educators interested in trans-inclusion in sports.

Birch-Jones, J. (2017). *Leading the Way: Working with LGBT Athletes and Coaches. A Practical Resource for Coaches*. Canadian Women and Sport. <https://womenandsport.ca/resources/publications/leading-the-way/>

Written for coaches, this report covers LGBTQ-phobia in sport, creating inclusive LGBTQ team environments, and best practices. There is a subsection on “Being Prepared for a Trans Athlete or Coach” (p. 22-24). Following the lead of the Canadian Centre for Ethics in Sport (2016), the recommendation is to “allow participation in the gender in which an individual identifies” (p. 23). This report emphasizes the need for coaches to be proactive about trans inclusion by educating themselves, ensuring that supportive policies and practices are in place, and that they are equipped to be supportive allies to transgender athletes.

Canadian Centre for Ethics in Sport. (2016). *Creating Inclusive Environments for Trans Participants in Canadian Sport: Guidance for Sport Organizations* (Trans Inclusion in Sport Expert Working Group). Canadian Centre for Ethics in Sport. <https://cces.ca/sites/default/files/content/docs/pdf/cces-transinclusionpolicyguidance-e.pdf>

This report has been taken up and cited by sport organizations and researchers around the world as a model for trans-inclusion in sport. It is targeted at policy makers and sports leaders, and covers four main areas: background and definitions, practice and policy guidance for recreation and developmental sports, issues and considerations for high-performance sport, and an appendices section that gives detailed guidance on best practices. For recreational and developmental sports, the Expert Working Group unequivocally states “individuals [...] should be able to participate in the gender with which they identify and not be subject to requirements for disclosure of personal information beyond those required of cisgender athletes” (p. 16). At the high-performance level, the Expert Group advocates that hormone therapy, surgical intervention, and disclosure of trans status should not be required. They do note, however, that other sport organizations, particularly at the International level, have other policies.

Canadian Centre for Ethics in Sport. (2016). *Creating Inclusive Environments for Trans Participants in Canadian Sport: Policy and Practice Template for Sport Organizations*. Canadian Centre for Ethics in Sport. https://cces.ca/sites/default/files/content/docs/pdf/creating_inclusive_environments_for_trans_participants_in_canadian_sport_practice_and_policy_template_final_e.pdf

Published in conjunction with the *Creating Inclusive Environments for Trans Participants in Canadian Sport: Guidance for Sports Organizations* report outlined above, this report is a collection of trans-inclusive policy templates and explanations for sports organizations. This report responds to requests from individuals who read the first report for more Canadian-specific guidance, particularly in light of Bill C-16, which added gender identity and expression to the Canadian Human Rights Act.

Canadian Centre for Gender and Sexual Diversity. (2012). *Sports Inclusion: A Supportive Guidebook for LGBTQI2S+ Athletes and Becoming a Better Ally in the Sports World*.

This guide is written with a wide readership in mind, from athletes and coaches to parents and volunteers. It introduces basic vocabulary and highlights the history of LGBTQI2S+ athletes. The guide examines the overall heterosexism and cissexism of sport and provides a trans allyship guide written at an individual-to-individual level. The report is rounded out by a discussion of inclusive policies and a section for parents. While this guide does not have the depth that other reports do, it is the most introductory guide for someone with no background on the subject.

Egale. (2017). *LGBTQI2S Sports Inclusion Toolkit Checklist*. <https://egale.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/LGBTQI2S-Sports-Inclusion-Toolkit-Checklist-3.pdf>

Designed as an assessment tool for sport organizations and stakeholders, this checklist considers all aspects of LGBTQ inclusion in sport. It allows organizations to consider what they are doing well and where they can improve.

GOVERNMENT - Provincial guidance

Various provincial Ministries of Education have documents that consider transgender, non-binary and two-spirit inclusion in provincial school systems. These documents advocate for minimizing sex-segregated activities. Where this cannot be done, readers are instructed to ensure students are able to participate in sex-segregated sports and access sex-segregated spaces in accordance with their gender identities. Some examples of these resource guides include:

Government of Manitoba. (2017). *Supporting Transgender and Gender Diverse Students in Manitoba Schools*.

https://www.edu.gov.mb.ca/k12/docs/support/transgender/full_doc.pdf

Government of Nova Scotia. (2015). *Guidelines for supporting transgender and gender-nonconforming students*.

https://studentservices.ednet.ns.ca/sites/default/files/Guidelines%20for%20Supporting%20Transgender%20Students_0.pdf

GOVERNMENT - Federal guidance

At the federal level, the Public Health Agency of Canada recognizes the distress that sex-segregated activities cause students who do not fit into a binary gender system. They advocate, “Gender variant youth should be allowed to join sports teams according to their self-identified gender as opposed to requiring them to join based on their biological sex” (para. 14).

Public Health Agency of Canada. (2014). *Questions and answers: Gender identity in schools*. Government of Canada. <https://www.canada.ca/en/public-health/services/infectious-diseases/sexual-health-sexually-transmitted-infections/reports-publications/questions-answers-gender-identity-schools.html>

REPORTS - Transgender athletes in sport (international)

For contrast with the Canadian documents listed above, the following is a partial list of national documents related to trans-inclusion in sport, some specific to school environments:

Australia

In Australia, guidelines revolve around the Sex Discrimination Act 1984 that includes gender identity protection, and since 2013 has recognized the non-binary nature of gender. The following resources tend to include more nuance and detail than Canadian guides. For example, various types of transitions (social, medical, and legal) are outlined, and the documents include a significant number of case studies and examples.

Australian Human Rights Commission. (2019). *Guidelines for the inclusion of transgender and gender diverse people in sport*. <https://humanrights.gov.au/our-work/lgbti/publications/guidelines-inclusion-transgender-and-gender-diverse-people-sport-2019>

ACT Human Rights Commission. (2017). *Everyone can play: Guidelines for local clubs on best practice inclusion of transgender and intersex participants*. Australian Capital Territory Government. <https://hrc.act.gov.au/everyone-can-play-guidelines-local-clubs-best-practice-inclusion-transgender-intersex-participants/>

Victorian Equal Opportunity & Human Rights Commission. (2017). *Trans and gender diverse inclusion in sport: Complying with the Equal Opportunity Act 2010*. <https://www.humanrights.vic.gov.au/resources/trans-and-gender-diverse-inclusion-in-sport-guideline/> [a simplified version of the guide is available at <https://www.humanrights.vic.gov.au/static/4da9c99cb0005c5947d206a5bef72b7f/The-Basics.pdf>]

New Zealand

New Zealand reports focus on broader school safety for LGBTQ+ students, and include brief sections on PE and sport.

InsideOUT. (2016). *Making Schools Safer for Trans and Gender Diverse Youth*.
<https://insideout.org.nz/resources/>

This guide to safer schools includes a page on sport, including guidance that a student who does not fit into male or female categories may opt to sit out of sex-segregated PE.

NZ Ministry of Education. (2018). *Guide to LGBTIQA+ Students*.
<https://www.inclusive.tki.org.nz/guides/supporting-lgbtiqua-students/>

A brief webpage focusing on experiences in PE and sport is included as part of a larger guide. The page gives an overview of concerns including a lack of access to gender-neutral facilities (washrooms, change rooms), gendered uniforms, and gender-specific sports teams.

United Kingdom

Association for Physical Education (UK). (2019). *Health & Safety Update—December 2019: Transgender Students*. https://www.afpe.org.uk/physical-education/wp-content/uploads/H_S_Decemb2019.pdf

This document directed at UK PHE educators was written in response to an increase in questions related to transgender students. It defines terminology, stresses inclusion within a broader framework of safe practice in PHE, and directs educators to be aware of policy so that they are confident in working with transgender students. There are FAQs related to sleeping arrangements on overnight trips, responding to student disclosures, and how to handle parents who might complain regarding “fairness.”

United States

The situation for trans high school student athletes in the US is highly variable, as rules are determined at the state athletic commission level. A visual guide to state policy can be found at <https://www.transathlete.com/k-12>.

GLSEN. (2020). *Gender Affirming and Inclusive Athletics Participation*.
<https://www.glsen.org/sites/default/files/2020-09/GENDER-AFFIRMING-INCLUSIVE-ATHLETICS-PARTICIPATION-SEP-2020.pdf>

This short document outlines why it is important for transgender, nonbinary, and gender non-conforming students to have equal access to sports, gives an overview of the range of state policies, and suggests model policy.

Griffin, P., & Carroll, H. J. (2010). *On the team: Equal opportunity for transgender student athletes*. National Center for Lesbian Rights. <https://www.nclrights.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/07/TransgenderStudentAthleteReport.pdf>

A frequently cited resource in the literature, this report gives an overview of the issues related to sport participation for high school and college transgender student athletes, policy recommendations, and best practices. It is one of the earliest documents created to address the issue.

Human Rights Campaign. (2017). *Play to win: Improving the lives of LGBTQ youth in sports*. <https://assets2.hrc.org/files/assets/resources/PlayToWin-FINAL.pdf>

Although this document is about the broader LGBTQ spectrum of youth in sports, it is included due to the detailed statistics related to sport participation. National survey data on sport participation are broken down by demographic categories that include genderqueer, non-binary, transgender boys and transgender girls, in addition to cisgender LGBTQ girls and boys. Other statistics include the percentage of transgender and gender expansive youth who are not “out” to their coaches about their gender identity (82%, n=2393) and information about feelings of safety in sports and locker rooms.

LGBT Sports Foundation. (2016). *Proposed Model High School Policy, “All 50”: The Transgender-Inclusive High School Sports and Activities Policy and Education Project*. https://docs.wixstatic.com/ugd/2bc3fc_c8eeefb073a8421396f6520a4cca9f3b.pdf

This is a proposed model policy for high school sports developed by the LGBT Sports Foundation and funded by Nike. It is based on the principle that “Transgender high school student-athletes will compete in the gender in which they identify and have a positive sport experience.” The Foundations hopes that this will become the standard policy across all states.

SHAPE America. (2020). *Transgender inclusion*. <https://www.shapeamerica.org/standards/guidelines/Transgender/?hkey=241d34b2-5445-4914-b863-cd4e68314e8b>

This brief webpage from the U.S. Society of Health and Physical Educators contains basic information about transgender inclusion in school PE and sport, including federal and state law, best practices, model policy, common barriers, and terminology.

Transgender Law & Policy Institute. (2009). *Guidelines for Creating Policies for Transgender Children in Recreational Sports*.

https://13248aea-16f8-fc0a-cf26-a9339dd2a3f0.filesusr.com/ugd/2bc3fc_6cd03b8e19147c71c0153c81e96babcb.pdf

The earliest American report found on the topic, this guide for welcoming trans children in recreational sports was published in 2009. While the report recommends that children be able to participate in sport based on their affirmed gender, it does contain provisions that produce barriers to participation, in the form of a required “letter from either the child’s therapist or doctor stating the child’s diagnosis and confirming the child’s gender identity” (p. 4).

International

OECD. (2019). *Making Physical Education Dynamic and Inclusive for 2030: International Curriculum Analysis* (OECD Future of Education 2030). https://www.oecd.org/education/2030-project/contact/OECD_FUTURE_OF_EDUCATION_2030_MAKING_PHYSICAL_DYNAMIC_AND_INCLUSIVE_FOR_2030.pdf

This report is included not for what it says about trans youth participation in PHE, but for what it does not say. Despite it being from 2019 and purporting to make PE inclusive by the year 2030, there is a complete lack of consideration for LGBTQ2S+ students in any meaningful way. Transgender students are never specifically mentioned.

To best develop and co-create programming that is inclusive for all students, explore PHE Canada's gender equity resources, found here:

phecanada.ca/genderequity

